

Beyond Inclusion and Exclusion: Jewish Experiences of the First World War in Central Europe, ed. Jason Crouthamel, Michael Geheran, Tim Grady and Julia Barbara Köhne

Beyond Inclusion and Exclusion: Jewish Experiences of the First World War in Central Europe, ed. Jason Crouthamel, Michael Geheran, Tim Grady and Julia Barbara Köhne (New York: Berghahn, 2019; pp. 407. \$130).

[Kathryn E Densford](#)

The English Historical Review, ceaa114, <https://doi-org.ezproxy.gvsu.edu/10.1093/ehr/ceaa114>

Published:

24 July 2020

Issue Section:

[Book Review](#)

The twelve essays in this book take an interdisciplinary approach, bringing together history, as well as film, gender and literary studies, to analyse the plurality of Central European Jewish wartime experiences. The volume, edited by Jason Crouthamel, Michael Geheran, Tim Grady and Julia Barbara Köhne is the result of a 2015 conference panel on Jewish soldiers during the First World War, and contributors have expanded upon the original theme to include a variety of pre-war, wartime, and post-war topics, including the experiences of Jewish women, which address the home and fighting fronts.

The essays critique existing scholarship on Jewish inclusion and exclusion because of its tendency to ‘obscure the complex, nuanced experiences of Jewish men and women who experienced often contradictory encounters that oscillated between signs of integration and acceptance and the perpetuation of negative stereotypes and

prejudices' (p. 4). Several authors in this volume mention Germany's 1916 'Jew Count', or *Judenzählung*, which counted the number of Jews in the army, but they do not focus on this as a moment of exclusion. Though scholars have previously viewed the 'Jew Count' as a breaking point in Jewish/non-Jewish relations, this volume demonstrates that many contemporary authors did not indicate this as a moment of rupture. More often, Jewish men and women reflected on their own lives and the ambiguity of their relationship to society as between inclusion and exclusion. The authors in this volume expand the discussion of Jewish experiences to demonstrate the convergence of Jewish and non-Jewish experiences. Several contributions highlight how gender analysis provides a lens through which to view commonalities among German Jews and non-Jews. Geographically, the book focuses on Central European Jewish experiences. The majority of the essays address German Jewish men and women, while a few examine Jewish experiences in Austria–Hungary, and some offer comparative perspectives that include American, British and French Jewish communities.

The volume is loosely organised around four interconnected themes. The chapters in Part One focus on minority experiences in the military. Christine G. Krüger compares German and French Jewish experiences during the wars of 1870–71 and 1914–18, demonstrating that different ideas of 'the nation' emerged in 1871, shaping experiences of the First World War. Tamara Scheer's chapter on Jews in the Habsburg Army employs published and unpublished autobiographical sources to show how non-Jews evaluated their Jewish comrades. She argues that while there was certainly anti-Semitism in the army, it was often connected to other social issues, though it did increase as the war went on. Moreover, she shows that many wartime accounts omitted the service of Jewish soldiers. Devlin M. Scofield analyses Alsatian experiences in the German Army. Though German state officials believed Alsations were disloyal, this was unfounded, and official suspicions only served to isolate Alsations from the state. Despite the importance of military service to modern citizenship, participation alone was not enough to prove loyalty to the state or ensure inclusion in society.

The second section, 'Relations', addresses contested identities. The essays in this section demonstrate the plurality of wartime experiences on both the home and fighting fronts. Michael Geheran examines Jewish experiences in the German Army, providing evidence of the diversity within the Jewish community and of Jewish experience. Sarah Panter explores the challenge Jews faced in balancing Jewish solidarity with loyalty to their respective states, taking an international approach to compare the intersection of German and Jewish identity in Austria, Germany, Britain and the United States. Andrea A. Sinn and Sabine Hank both focus on the experiences of Jewish women. Their work suggests ways in which gender could define women's experiences, perhaps even in ways that stressed female solidarity. Taking a similar approach to Scheer, Jason Crouthamel examines Jewish and non-Jewish perceptions of one another in war letters and diaries. His analysis of the ideals of manliness and comradeship demonstrates that Jews and non-Jews in the military shared these concepts. Furthermore, by including incidents of sympathy as well as anti-Semitism, Crouthamel demonstrates that the memory of service could be one of both inclusion and exclusion.

Part Three focuses on post-1918 cultural representations of the war. Philipp Stiasny's contribution addresses wartime Galicia through inter-war film. He analyses films made in Hollywood and Berlin that portray Jewish Galician experience and Habsburg nostalgia. Glenda Abramson examines Hebrew war fiction produced decades after the conflict. In the final section, Julia Barbara Köhne and Florian Brückner discuss memory and the war's legacies, the ways in which individuals and the larger German community understood front-line experiences.

This volume should be of interest to historians of the First World War as well as those who are interested in Jewish and gender studies. While many chapters focus on Jewish inclusion and exclusion in wartime, they collectively demonstrate how the line dividing the two could be unclear or even lacking, something that Derek Jonathan Penslar acknowledges in the Afterword. Indeed, one of the strengths of this volume is the contributors' ability to identify these unclear moments and points of convergence of German and Jewish experiences. This collection suggests the fruitfulness of

studying such moments, and some areas for future research. The editors rightly describe the First World War as one of ‘traveling and journeys’ (p. 3); but only a few references are made in this volume to the journeys that many Central European Jews made as refugees. The focus on German-speaking Jews of German nationality suggests the need for further scholarship on Eastern Central European Jews during the war and the potential for comparison with the larger German-speaking Jewish world.

© Oxford University Press 2020. All rights reserved.

This article is published and distributed under the terms of the Oxford University Press, Standard Journals Publication Model (https://academic-oup-com.ezproxy.gvsu.edu/journals/pages/open_access/funder_policies/chorus/standard_publication_model)